

APPENDIX 5

Records of Public Meetings:

- St Alban's RC Primary School (2nd October 2019)
- Willows High School (9th October 2019)



**Schools Programme
Record of Public Meeting
St Alban's RC Primary School – 02 Oct 2019
6.30pm – 8pm**



(SOP), Anita Batten (HR), Els Rowland (HR), Rosalie Phillips (SOP), Hibah Iqbal (SOP), Martin Price (Catholic Archdiocese), Brett Pugh (Catholic Archdiocese), Ann Robertson (Catholic Archdiocese)

Please note: The following is not a transcript but a contemporaneous note of the meeting.

| No | Heading | Action |
|----|---|--------|
| | <p>Michele Duddridge Friedl (MDF) opened the meeting, welcomed those present and introduced officers and Diocesan representatives.</p> <p>A presentation was delivered by Michele Duddridge Friedl and Ann Robertson (AR) setting out details of the proposal:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Proposal• Consultation Drop-in dates• School catchment map within Willows HS catchment• Background – why are we proposing these changes?• Condition and Suitability• What is being proposed - outline• Closure of St Alban's RC Primary• St Alban's RC Primary pupils• Take up of places in Adamsdown/Splott• Take up of places EM community primary schools• Take up of places Faith primary schools• Take up of places EM secondary schools• Why expand and replace Willows HS?• Post-16 provision• Public-space and community facilities• Indicative location and scale of new school site• Quality and standards• Benefits of proposal• Risks• Potential disadvantages• Alternative options• Finance• Other considerations• What happens next? <p>During and after the presentation the following comments were made/questions asked.</p> | |

| No | Heading | Action |
|----|--|--------|
| | <p>AR – consulting on a proposal and welcome all views. If progressed as set out, pupils wanting Catholic education would be applying to transfer to other Catholic primaries. St Peter’s is the closest school but there are other schools also and would be ensuring that schools were amending admission policies to give priority to baptised catholic children from the Splott/Tremorfa area. Option also for pupils to transfer to an enlarged Baden Powell Primary School/other primary schools. Aware that there has been a lot said about St Peter’s being full; the school has a standard admission number of 75 and not at this level at present; Reception children would be given appropriate priority as baptised catholic children.</p> <p>P – the number of catholic pupils at the school was not confirmed ahead of the proposal being brought forward. The proposed closure is based on the decline in the number of baptised catholic children and leadership issues. It has become apparent that the number of baptised children at the school is higher than what was presented in the Archdiocese letter to the Council.</p> <p>AR – the figures were based on the annual census which normally takes place in January and which the Archdiocese are notified of in the summer. Schools submit figures to the Catholic Education Service (CES) with the next census due in January. Will be discussing with the CES and looking at how to verify figures.</p> <p>P – the letter presented to Cabinet was wrong and the Archdiocese should be writing to the Cabinet tomorrow to withdraw the proposal.</p> <p>BP – the figures were submitted by the school; had those in good faith and the position as far as know was correct at that time.</p> <p>P – the Archdiocese should have checked. Lack of leadership has compounded issues.</p> <p>P – what has the Archdiocese done to help/guide and direct the school?</p> <p>AR – the Archdiocese works in partnership with the LA in terms of school improvement.</p> <p>P – have been trying to improve the school playground for years with no help or support.</p> <p>P – was not aware that the land belongs to The Rosminian Order; can’t take a school from someone else’s land. This is about money. Quoted from an article in The Catholic Times on World Day of the Poor on 17 November. This is a deprived area; parents are being expected to send their children on buses to other schools; children will end up going to non catholic schools. The local MP, Stephen Doughty is supporting us; where is the Archbishop?</p> | |

| No | Heading | Action |
|----|---|--------|
| | <p>AR – the Archbishop is at another meeting this evening. The proposal is not about money.</p> <p>S – the school belongs to the Rosminians.</p> <p>AR – the Rosminians operate within the Archdiocese. There are regular meetings with the order but not party to those meetings and unable to comment. All issues raised will be addressed in the consultation report. The Archdiocese works with the LA and CSC to support schools; there isn't a team of advisers within the Diocese.</p> <p>P – was the school given targets to achieve? What did the Archdiocese do to help? What has the Archdiocese done to increase the number of catholic children?</p> <p>P – children spend seven years in primary school; what will happen to the children here?</p> <p>AR – would work with other catholic schools to ensure transition.</p> <p>P – who will fund the cost of transport?</p> <p>P – how do you expect children to walk to St Peter's or St John Lloyd. St Peter's has been allowed to take catholic children from this area with 103 pupils from this catchment in St Peter's. Why has this not changed?</p> <p>AR – if places are available they have to be allocated; children have to take Holy Communion in their parish. Issues around Holy Communion a matter for parish priests.</p> <p>P – teach children to love one another; believe in one God. The Archdiocese is willing to chuck children out.</p> <p>AR – Communion is a parish matter</p> <p>P – how will St Alban's Church survive?</p> <p>AR – the parish is doing well.</p> <p>P – the future of the church are the children; destroying the church.</p> <p>P – how would you feel if it was your child/grandchild? What would you be doing?</p> | |

| No | Heading | Action |
|----|---|--------|
| | <p>AR – look at nearest catholic school.</p> <p>P – expecting parents to get children to school is all weathers; Catholic faith will be lost.</p> <p>P – this is a deprived area. Children from this school go on to St Illtyd's; see potential in our children.</p> <p>P – this is an amazing school which can only get better.</p> <p>RP – opportunity with Willows to have significant investment in this area.</p> <p>P – Willows will not benefit our children.</p> <p>P – how will parents get children to alternative schools? Logistics and costs; parents don't have the money and no help being offered.</p> <p>AR – this was raised at drop in session and would have to look at options.</p> <p>P – children are going to St Peter's because they want to go to Corpus Christi; that could be stopped by the Archbishop.</p> <p>P – the emotional wellbeing of children is not being considered.</p> <p>P – parents will have to apply for children to transfer; no automatic right to transfer.</p> <p>MDF – parents would have to tell us which school they wanted.</p> <p>P – can you guarantee that children can go to the next nearest school; St Peter's is in special measures.</p> <p>P – how can parents get children to school?</p> <p>AR – if the proposal is progressed we will need to look at transport issues.</p> <p>P – close St Peter's and St Alban's and build a super catholic school.</p> <p>MDF – first suggestion to do something different. This is a consultation; understand you don't like the proposal. Are there other ideas?</p> <p>P – children would be numbers. Have heard horror stories about Baden Powell.</p> | |

| No | Heading | Action |
|----|---|--------|
| | <p>P – what about the teachers? What will happen to them? MDF – TUPE does not apply; would work with other schools.</p> <p>P – teacher at the school; have not changed how we support children. Love that you champion us; the Council will support us but we will fight to keep our jobs.</p> <p>P – why was no one from the Archdiocese present at the Cabinet meeting? A number of parents made the effort.</p> <p>AR – issues around manpower within the Diocese.</p> <p>P – proposing to close a school.</p> <p>P – how will the Archdiocese get its future believers into church? The school takes children to mass every Friday.</p> <p>P – closing a catholic school where people are struggling; going against what the Pope is saying.</p> <p>P – do you think that God wants you to close this school? AR – there are sufficient places available across the wider area.</p> <p>P – the Archbishop didn't bother to come. Is there any way we can have St Alban's and Willows? Cllr Thomas – campaigned on building a new Willows in 2017; closing St Alban's was not on our agenda; argument for two decisions to be split out; catholic element important to you.</p> <p>P – why only increasing Tremorfa Nursery from 112 places to 128? MDF – total number would match demand.</p> <p>P – state schools can teach what they want. Cllr Thomas – previously Head of Christian Aid in Wales. It is not for the Council to provide faith education but hear that you want a catholic education.</p> | |

| No | Heading | Action |
|----|--|--------|
| | <p>P – what does Canon Law say about moving children to schools in special measures?</p> <p>AR – improving position at St Peter's.</p> <p>P – lots of concerns around Tremorfa Park also.</p> <p>MDF – local members here to understand views. We take your views and present them to those who made decisions. We need to understand issues; local members want to be here.</p> <p>P – Stephen Doughty (MP) arranged a meeting for 09 July with the Archdiocese and Councillors which was cancelled on the day. Who cancelled the meeting?</p> <p>Cllr Stubbs – do not support the Archdiocese decision to close the school. People's lives need to be taken into account; too far for children to travel. Not a catholic but part of this area. Appreciate concerns being raised; would like Archdiocese to see school as part of a mission; concerns well founded. Hope that changes in data will be taken on board. Archdiocese part of church and want it to thrive; real passion for catholic education here.</p> <p>P – close Baden Powell or St Peter's but not St Alban's.</p> <p>P – was the removal of the Rosminians and introduction of Oratory know to those brining forward the proposal?</p> <p>AR – no.</p> <p>P – if children are coming to school, they are learning catholic faith. Who is the Archbishop to put families through this? People have decided to bring their children to this school for the best possible education.</p> <p>P – going to cut down park. What will happen to the rugby club?</p> <p>RP – the rugby club would remain.</p> <p>P – no planning assessments undertaken.</p> <p>RP – early stages of project. Rugby club is going to continue.</p> <p>P – look at everyone here and please reconsider.</p> <p>P – were any other schools considered for closure? St Cuthberts?</p> | |

| No | Heading | Action |
|----|---|--------|
| | <p>AR – the closure of St Cuthbert’s was consulted on previously and the school did not close.</p> <p>P – local resident with concerns around traffic and the destruction of trees. Where will children play rugby, walk the dog. Where will money for the park come from? Proposed park is miles away.</p> <p>RP – enhanced facilities for school and community.</p> <p>P – where will kids play during the building programme; no play areas of children.</p> <p>RP – would look to phase to allow for facilities.</p> <p>Fr Scanlon – who owns the land on which the school is built? What is the percentage of catholic children? Children pick up the ethos of the school. The Rosminians first came here 130 years ago to educate children. The loss of the school would be a travesty.</p> <p>Governor – so lovely to see you all here and passionate about the school. The school has to stay where it is.</p> <p>During the meeting the points raised were noted on a flipchart and included the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If you take the school away from the children you take away the faith from the area • Children will have to walk in all weathers or parents will have to pay for transport they can’t afford • St Alban’s represents a positive option with regards to long term prospects • Invest in the school to make it even better • Loss of access to public open space • Loss of access to the park during school hours • The numbers the proposal is based on are incorrect • The land the school sits on it owned by the Rosminian Order • The proposal is about money • Deprivation in the area has not been considered; children need primary catholic education • Transport to alternative schools • Crossing the road is not reasonable • Lots of children from the local area go to St Peter’s; why have catchment areas not been changed? • Children would have to undertake Holy Communion separate from their friends • The school should welcome families of all faiths | |

| No | Heading | Action |
|----|--|--------|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The parish of St Alban's will suffer with the number of worshipers declining • Close Baden Powell/St Peter's instead • Was the change from Rosminian Order to Oratory know at the point of the proposal being brought forward • Concern that there will not be the same level of facilities available for St Alban's RFC • Concerns that St Alban's Club won't be able to operate during the building works • What does Canon Law say about moving pupils to a school that is in special measures? • There should be another public meeting in addition to the one at Willows • Cllr Stubbs does not support the proposal to close St Alban's • The proposal is not consistent with the catholic mission as expressed by the Pope as reported in the Catholic Times • Why was the Archbishop not at the meeting? • Support the proposal to rebuild Willow but not the closure of St Alban's RC Primary School • Concern that there may not be enough nursery places • Suggestion to close St Peter's and St Alban's and form a new 'super school' • 3FE is too big; it won't support children's needs • No one from the Archdiocese was present at the Cabinet meeting • The Archdiocese is undertaking an evangelising drive; how will that happen if the school is not here to service the pupils • The emotional health and wellbeing of pupils at the school is not being considered • Leadership needs support; if you back them the school will succeed • Lack of family support to enable access to alternative schools • What about the committed staff who come from miles away to work at the school? • Will staff be forced to reapply for jobs? • Concerns re increased traffic and transport, reduction of public open space for dog walking, for children to play sport • Concerns that the general public will not be able to access facilities • The replacement parkland at Willows is miles away and is not a good substitute • Non catholic children benefit from catholic education • Headteacher is willing to do the job permanently <p>MDF thanked those present and the meeting closed.</p> | |



**Schools Programme
Record of Public Meeting
Willows HS – 9th Oct 2019
6.30pm – 8pm**



Present: Michele Duddridge-Friedl (SOP), Mike Tate (Assistant Director Education), Brett Andrewartha (SOP), Beverley Bailey (PM), Janine Nightingale (Economic Development), Shirley Karseras (SOP)

Please note: The following is not a transcript but a contemporaneous note of the meeting.

| No | Heading |
|----|--|
| | <p>Circa 20 members of the public attended including some children.</p> <p>Michele Duddridge Friedl (MDF) opened the meeting, welcomed those present and introduced officers.</p> <p>A presentation was delivered by MDF setting out details of the proposal:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Proposal• Consultation Drop-in dates• School catchment map within Willows HS catchment• Background – why are we proposing these changes?• Condition and Suitability• What is being proposed - outline• Closure of St Alban's RC Primary• St Alban's RC Primary pupils• Take up of places in Adamsdown/Splott• Take up of places EM community primary schools• Take up of places Faith primary schools• Take up of places EM secondary schools• Why expand and replace Willows HS?• Post-16 provision• Public-space and community facilities• Indicative location and scale of new school site• Quality and standards• Benefits of proposal• Risks• Potential disadvantages• Alternative options• Finance• Other considerations• What happens next? <p>During and after the presentation the following comments were made/questions asked.</p> |

| No | Heading |
|----|--|
| | <p data-bbox="284 170 1378 237">MDF - the school figures for St Alban's RC PS are being checked by the Diocese as there is concern that they may be incorrect.</p> <p data-bbox="284 322 1378 461">The flood plain can be built on but at a much greater cost. The LA must consider the best value of financial investment. JN highlighted the area of the flood zone on the map and stated that the north east area of Tremorfa Park is the only location where the proposal is viable.</p> <p data-bbox="284 546 1378 613">The capital receipt of the Baden Powell site would have to be considered but it is not part of the financial model of this proposal.</p> <p data-bbox="284 698 1378 725">Questions and Concerns were recorded as follows:</p> <p data-bbox="284 810 1378 913">P - the defensive works to rectify the issues with the flood zone in this area of Cardiff should be brought forward which would mean that the school could remain on its existing site. The Authority are not taking a long term view.</p> <p data-bbox="284 999 1378 1102">JN - the schedule of work would take at least 4 years before the NRW could assess its impact. It is thought that the risk would only reduce rather than be eradicated. There is money now to replace a category D school.</p> <p data-bbox="284 1187 1378 1290">P – there is a large amount of good in the proposal however the concentration of families attending one site will add to the pressures on roads within the area which are already busy. They won't cope with added pressure.</p> <p data-bbox="284 1317 1378 1344">MDF - road access and infrastructure will be considered as part of any development.</p> <p data-bbox="284 1429 1378 1568">P - there is already a large amount of congestion with poor traffic flow. The air pollution from the traffic fumes is already bad. The air is only being kept clean currently with the parks and the trees and the flooding will also get worse if the trees are removed.</p> <p data-bbox="284 1594 1378 1809">JN – it is worth noting that new school builds are extremely mindful of ecology (e.g. trees and bats) and the ecology of the surrounding area. They have to be built with Sustainable Drainage Systems (SuDs) which can incorporate swales and embankments. The Fitzalan High School design has managed to retain all the trees in the locality. This level of detail has not been included in the proposal as it is only a proposal at this stage.</p> <p data-bbox="284 1895 1378 1962">All the trees in Tremorfa Park are in the area where the new school building is proposed to go. The water table is currently very high and this will only get worse.</p> |

| No | Heading |
|----|--|
| | <p>MT – the ecology of the area will be considered. Semi mature trees can be planted elsewhere on the site for example.</p> <p>P – there are gaps in the consultation as there is no reference to surveys on trees or flooding. How can we respond to a proposal when there is information missing.</p> <p>MT – we are not asking for a yes or no decision.</p> <p>P - the proposal isn't inclusive as it is too far to ask elderly residents or residents with young children to walk to the far side of the park to use the facilities.</p> <p>P - has anyone actually visited the park? We do not want a school there, it will ruin the peace and tranquillity and I will be forced to move.</p> <p>JN – yes. There are areas that need to be protected.</p> <p>P - it will affect people in different ways but if we say we don't want this and we don't want that, the school will be built out of the area and the community would not have any access to its facilities.</p> <p>JN - Willows High School is category D and needs to be rebuilt.</p> <p>P - where am I going to be able to walk my dogs?</p> <p>MT – other provision will be put in place.</p> <p>P - the rugby club will be adjacent to site of the new school. This is an indication to primary school children that drinking alcohol is ok.</p> <p>P - some sacrifices might be needed by some for the good of the community as a good new primary school and secondary school would be great for the community. However, what about the RC children in the area having to suffer?</p> <p>MDF – St Alban's RC Primary School have given different figures which the diocese are reviewing.</p> <p>P - there is no heart from the councillors to close this school.</p> <p>MT – that may change the proposal, it is important to capture all views.</p> <p>P – how high will the building be?</p> <p>MDF – this is still a proposal.</p> |

| No | Heading |
|----|---|
| | <p>P - there is a paid facility beside Splott Park so no option for community play park. There will be no facility throughout the build. UNCRC article 31 states that children have the right to play. There is a worry that the budget for a play area may go as it would be argued that it is not part of the education budget afterwards.</p> <p>MDF – there is anti-social behaviour in the area with mopeds and some people fear it will be worse after the build.</p> <p>MT – anti-social behaviour reduced in area of Bae Baglan School as the community were utilising the community facilities.</p> <p>P - there is very little in the way of budget for youth services within Cardiff Council. This community benefit may not work in this locality. What was the category of the school that existed in the area of Bae Baglan?</p> <p>MT – there were 50% exclusions which reduced to 12%. Head teachers worked with the community groups to understand their needs. Some local community members were able to set up their own businesses e.g. yoga classes.</p> <p>P - community involvement can lead to good schools and better leadership, but new schools need good leadership.</p> <p>MT – leadership is only one part. Community involvement generates pride in a school and a feeling of shared ownership. Transformational leadership increases aspirations for our children.</p> <p>P – I had a conversation with Councillor Huw Thomas who stated that the poor Estyn report for Willows HS was because of poor buildings. However I read the report and it is due to bad leadership. There must be a faith in the leadership, not just provide a new building. Councillor Thomas did not deny that the decision had been made prior to the consultation ending.</p> <p>P - can Splott Park be used for the site of the new school?</p> <p>JN – no as it would cost too much money, consultation on this was not an option as it could not be built there.</p> <p>P - will children be in the same building? There are safeguarding issues involved with this.</p> <p>P - the anti-social behaviour issues associated with mopeds will only become worse by introducing more entrances and access to the park.</p> |

| No | Heading |
|----|---|
| | <p data-bbox="284 170 948 203">Issue with school response email. Checked by BA.</p> <p data-bbox="284 226 1378 293">MT – there is another drop-in planned at St Albans Rugby Club which is still to be arranged.</p> <p data-bbox="284 376 1378 443">During the meeting the points raised were noted on a flipchart and included the following:</p> <ul data-bbox="284 533 1378 1960" style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="284 533 1378 667">• Concern re the flood defences. If invested in, there would be more scope for school development but also protecting resident's homes which is as important for local people including children and young people accessing the proposed schools. <li data-bbox="284 725 1378 815">• the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act is about those that come after us, the timing of these proposals is not appropriate given we know how the situation could change shortly. <li data-bbox="284 828 1378 884">• concerns re the scale of building and number of children accessing the site and associated traffic and transport impact. <li data-bbox="284 898 1378 1021">• agree with investment and needs set out, but don't feel it really captures potential for negative impact on residents. Traffic is already an issue e.g. Rover Way funerals, issues with Bay link / Rover Way – congestion and fumes are already unacceptable. <li data-bbox="284 1034 1107 1068">• very polluted area already with steel works and congestion. <li data-bbox="284 1070 1321 1104">• the trees are essential, if you remove them the flooding risk could be worse. <li data-bbox="284 1106 1378 1173">• the removal of natural habitat for birds and bats has not been considered sufficiently <li data-bbox="284 1176 1378 1265">• feel that information about the ecology and sustainability should have been made available. Absence of traffic and transport information and can't make an informed decision. <li data-bbox="284 1279 1378 1335">• concern that the sustainable drainage solutions that have been put in by the Council to date at the base of Tremorfa Park are not effective. <li data-bbox="284 1348 1378 1415">• concerns re accessibility of the park by elderly and disabled residents – this does not take account of their needs. <li data-bbox="284 1417 1378 1485">• peaceful and tranquil area and it will be spoilt by having a school outside my house. <li data-bbox="284 1487 826 1520">• concern that there will be more crime. <li data-bbox="284 1523 1378 1590">• no local space for exercising dogs – the proposals mean parkland will be much further away. <li data-bbox="284 1592 1378 1682">• St Albans RFC clubhouse is less known for its club and more as a pub – it's counter-intuitive to locate school provision on the same site as a drinking establishment. <li data-bbox="284 1695 1378 1796">• proposal to remove play facility from Splott Park (to be replaced by private facility) which is not reflected here and means the loss of 2 out of 3 play areas which is essential under UNCRC. <li data-bbox="284 1798 1378 1933">• a strong leader could deliver the benefits from existing building, the leadership here doesn't do this. The current leadership at the school is not capable of making a vibrant community school work. Need an investment in leadership before asking us to trust. <li data-bbox="284 1935 1118 1968">• Splott Park would have represented even greater synergies. |

| No | Heading |
|----|--|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• owing to flood issues, what we are actually being asked is: do we want a local school and if so, it will be there, the alternative is our local school is located outside our area.• Councillor Thomas refused to deny his mind was not made up to a local resident when asked.• congestion: consideration of traffic flow through Splott regarding 'short cut' traffic continues through to Vale. |